



**Report on a
A WILDLIFE LAW ENFORCEMENT TRAINING WORKSHOP
FOR FIELD STAFF IN THE
NOMROG STRICTLY PROTECTED AREA, MONGOLIA
September 3 – 9th 2008**



**IN CONJUNCTION WITH
The State Specialized Inspection Agency
Implementation Agency of the Government of Mongolia
State Border Defence Agency
Regulatory Agency of the Government of Mongolia
The Protected Area Authority
Mongolian Ministry of Nature and Environment**

**by Antony J. Lynam with contributions from
Amanda E. Fine, Ann M. Winters, L. Ochirkhuyag and N. Odonchimeg
and Kh. Badam**



Executive Summary

1. A wildlife law enforcement training workshop was conducted during 3 – 9th September 2008 at Degee Gol Outpost, in the Nomrog Strictly Protected Area, eastern Mongolia. This was made possible through grants from the World Bank and USAID. The purpose of the workshop was to review the progress of patrolling and other wildlife enforcement activities at Nomrog SPA following government staff training and capacity development exercises in previous years (Lynam, 2006; 2007).
2. Refresher training was provided to update staff capacity in the areas of environmental laws and regulations, navigation, patrol tools and strategy. Instruction followed a Mongolian language staff training curriculum (Lynam, 2006b) and was provided by Mongolian Government officials and international conservation specialists.
3. In the three years since this program of support began, Mongolian government staff responsible for wildlife enforcement work have been provided with core equipment needed to conduct anti-poaching patrols including Global Positioning System (GPS) devices, batteries, solar charges, navigation compasses, topographic map sheets, binoculars, spotting scopes, standardized patrol forms and wildlife identification guides. In addition to equipment, park rangers, state inspectors, volunteer rangers and border guards at three zastavs inside Nomrog received comprehensive theory and field practical training, and been equipped to conduct wildlife enforcement.
4. The state border defence agency has been pleased with the training program and thanked the WCS training team for their support at a ceremony on September 10th, 2008. Moreover, the training program has now developed sufficient capacity for effective wildlife enforcement in the Eastern Steppes. It is now time for border guards and environmental inspectors to demonstrate their capacity towards protecting wildlife and wild lands.
5. Border guards and environmental inspectors have been asked to undertake wildlife-focussed enforcement activities over the next three months, and to provide evidence that enforcement interventions are being actively undertaken. The Nomrog SPA's administration director, Mr R. Unenbat, and Commander of Sumber Border Division, Colonel Lkhachinjav Sharkhuu, have agreed to the engagement of their respective field staff in a schedule of cooperative wildlife activities. A meeting should be held before the end of the year to assess the effectiveness of these activities.
6. If satisfactory progress is being made, the next step will be to develop and implement a Wildlife Protection Strategy for the Nomrog SPA. The strategy would involve institutionalizing anti-poaching patrols for monitoring incursions into the reserve, information gathering and strengthening border controls on illegal wildlife trade. Coordinated monthly activities involving border guards and environmental inspectors would be arranged, along with independent enforcement activities by each agency. A sustainable source of funding will need to be secured for implementing such a strategy.
7. WCS has a role to play in facilitating discussion about updating a previous agreement between State Border Defence Agency and MNE regarding collaboration on wildlife enforcement activities. Having this agreement in place will help to ensure the success of any Wildlife Protection Strategy.

Acknowledgements

This field training exercise was invited by the State Border Defence Agency (SBDA). We especially thank Colonel Lkhachinjav Sharkhuu, Commander of Sumber Border Division, Dornod. Presentations were made by Amanda E.Fine, Ann M.Winters, KH. Badam , Antony Lynam. Simultaneous translations during the training workshop were done by N. Odonchimeg. Logistics at the training sites, transportation, food and accommodation were arranged by Sumber Border division and Degee Gol Outpost. The training was made possible by a grant from the World Bank's Netherlands-Mongolia Trust Fund for Environmental Reform.

Contents

<i>Executive Summary</i>	<i>2</i>
<i>Acknowledgements.....</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>Contents.....</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>Introduction.....</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Purpose.....</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Objectives.....</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Training manual</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Participants</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Part 1. Introduction</i>	<i>7</i>
Presentation 1: Status of wildlife trade in Mongolia	7
Presentation 2: Role of enforcement staff in stopping illegal wildlife trade	8
Presentation 3: Community Based Wildlife Conservation in Eastern Mongolia	8
Summary points:.....	9
<i>Part II. Legislation and Law Enforcement.....</i>	<i>10</i>
Presentation 4: Review of environmental laws pertaining to protected areas (follows module 4a in manual)	10
Competency achieved:.....	10
Summary points:.....	10
Recommendations:	11
Suggested follow-up:.....	11
<i>Part III. Field craft</i>	<i>11</i>
Presentation 5: Review of use of compass and map for navigation and orientation (follows module 10 in training manual)	11
Competency achieved:.....	11
Summary points:.....	12
Recommendations:	12
Suggested follow-up:.....	12
Presentation 6. Review of Global Positioning System (GPS) for georeferencing locations and for navigation and orientation (based on module 11 in training manual)	12
Competency achieved:.....	12
Summary points:.....	13
Recommendations:	13
Suggested follow-up:.....	14
Presentation 7: Patrol strategy and techniques – use of patrol forms	14
Competency achieved:.....	14
Summary points:.....	14
Recommendations:	14
Presentations 8-10: Patrol strategy and techniques – current approaches by border guards, protected area rangers and community rangers.	14
Competency achieved:.....	15
Summary points:.....	15
Recommendations:	15
Presentation 11. International best practices for wildlife patrols.	15

Competency achieved:.....	16
Summary points:.....	16
Recommendations:	16
Suggested follow-up:.....	16
Literature cited.....	17
Annex 1. Training participants, instructors and training assistants.....	18
Annex 2. Participant evaluation.....	23
Annex 3. Photographs from the training workshop	25

Introduction

Located in Mongolia's Eastern Steppes, the Nomrog Strictly Protected Area supports populations of a number of regionally and globally threatened wildlife species including Red Deer, Roe Deer, Manchurian Moose, Grey Wolf, and Lynx. The reserve includes part of the former range of the Manchurian Tiger, and is a potential future reintroduction site for Takhi.

Despite its potential, Nomrog is threatened by a range of factors, the main one being unsustainable wildlife harvest (Lynam, 2005a, Heffernan, 2005, Olson et al., 2004). This is caused by (1) cross-border incursions, encroachment and poaching by foreign nationals, (2) poaching and habitat destruction by government staff who live in the protected areas, and (3) poaching by influential Mongolian and foreign outsiders. In general illegal hunting and wildlife trade are the greatest threats to Mongolia's wildlife and will lead to species extinctions if action is not taken (Zahler et al., 2004, Wingard and Zahler, 2006).

Efforts to reduce these threats can succeed if border guards, the only resident staff in the reserve, exercise their legal mandate to enforce environmental laws, if they themselves respect the law, if staff capacity can be raised to enable environmental law enforcement (Heffernan et al., 2005, Lynam, 2005a), and if they are able to effectively coordinate wildlife enforcement activities with other relevant agencies.

WCS has conducted annual training with the border guards, and environmental inspectors since 2006. With the training phase now completed, we turn our attention to monitoring enforcement efforts. This is a report on a review of the wildlife protection program held at Degee Gol Outpost of Sumber Border Division during 3 – 9th September 2008.

Purpose

To provide refresher training to border guards, volunteer rangers and environmental inspectors in the area of wildlife enforcement, and review the program of interagency collaboration in the Nomrog Strictly Protected Area, MNE.

Objectives

- (1) To develop staff capacity in wildlife conservation principles, field craft, awareness of laws and regulations, and practical techniques for applying environmental laws;
- (2) To assess current efforts to reduce wildlife crime in and adjacent to Nomrog SPA;
- (3) To review the effectiveness of collaboration between border guards and environmental protection agencies.

Training manual

A previous Mongolian-language training handbook was used for staff training at Nomrog. Sections covered in this refresher training exercise included environmental laws and protected status of Mongolian wildlife (Module 4), enforcement patrol activities (Module 5), map and compass (Module 10), and use of GPS in navigation. A new module on patrol strategy and techniques, including use of patrol forms was part of this year's curriculum.

Participants

Fifteen Mongolian Government staff participated in the training workshop (see Annex 1). Eleven participants were State Border Defence Agency field staff. Nine were staff based at

one of three posts in the Nomrog Strictly Protected Area, and two were officers from the Sumber Border Division which oversees the Nomrog posts. Two rangers and one voluntary ranger of the Ministry of Nature and Environment with direct responsibility for Nomrog SPA participated. One community ranger from the Eastern Steppes project joined as an observer. Six Mongolia and foreign experts participated as instructors and training assistants (Annex 1).

Part 1. Introduction

Presentation 1: Status of wildlife trade in Mongolia

Duration: 1 hrs

Presenters: Dr Amanda Fine and Odonchimeg Nyamtseren

Content: The WCS Landscape Species Approach is a wildlife-based strategy for defining and conserving wild landscapes. In Mongolia, this approach has been used to identify conservation priorities in the Eastern Steppes Program. As part of this program threat assessments have been conducted to prioritize needed actions to conserve landscape species. Research and surveys have been done to enumerate populations, and guide policy towards protected areas. Collaborative wildlife protection activities involving border guards and environmental inspectors, and activities with local herder communities is helping to increase awareness about the need for protecting wildlife. In the second part of the presentation, a review of the available information on hunting and wildlife trade in Mongolia was given, including market surveys and current trends in wildlife trade.

Training aids: Powerpoint presentations.

Summary points:

1. Eight landscape species are targets for conservation efforts in the Eastern Steppes; Mongolian Gazelle, Grey Wolf, Eastern Moose, Siberian Marmot, White-napped Crane, Asiatic Grass Frog, Saker Falcon, and Taimen.
2. Results of scientific research and surveys have helped define the conservation landscapes and suit of threats facing Mongolian gazelle, Siberian marmots and important bird areas. This has helped to determine the management efforts that will be needed in future to save these species.
3. A national wildlife trade survey was organized in 2006, culminating in a landmark “Silent steppe: The Illegal Wildlife Trade Crisis in Mongolia.” Among the many recommendations suggested to reduce illegal trade was improved hunting management and enforcement interventions in wildlife markets.
4. In collaboration with municipal inspection agencies, WCS has conducted wildlife trade surveys in Ulaanbaatar hospitals, restaurants, souvenir shops and media advertisements during 2007/2008. Inspections were done with Municipal SIA and the results, number and type of violations, actions taken, confiscated items, penalties and recommendations were discussed. These surveys detected wildlife products and parts of 51 species. Except for wild boar and some fish species, all the species detected were protected by Mongolian Laws on Fauna, Hunting, and/or are in Red Data and CITES lists. This illustrates that illegal wildlife trade continues to be a problem.

5. Recommendations for follow-up action include paying more attention to the certificate of origin of wildlife for sale, follow-up on media advertisements for wildlife, better enforcement to make confiscations of illegal wildlife and products and parts, increase follow-up with environmental inspectors on reports of illegal wildlife, increase budgets for inspections, improved safety for inspectors , registration of traders/ dealers in the markets

Presentation 2: Role of enforcement staff in stopping illegal wildlife trade

Duration: 1 hr

Presenter: Antony Lynam

Content: Wildlife trade involves an organized chain including poachers, traders and buyers. Border guards, inspectors and park rangers all play a role helping to reduce illegal trade. Interventions aimed at stopping poaching include anti-poaching patrols and roadblocks, stopping trading through gathering of information from various sources, monitoring markets and public roads, and stopping buying by changing awareness. Examples were illustrated of how enforcement staff are doing these things in different Asian countries. Mongolian enforcement staff have overlapping duties and should coordinate to do effective enforcement of environmental law.

Training aids: Powerpoint presentations.

Summary points:

1. Illegal wildlife trade is worth over \$US10 billion per year and is
2. Illegal wildlife trade is organized and involves the cooperation of three groups; people who supply wildlife, people who trade wildlife and people who consume wildlife.
3. Enforcement is a necessary intervention for dealing with illegal wildlife trade. Example from conservation sites in Africa and Asia show that rates of illegal activity and criminal behaviour are influenced by the efforts made by enforcement staff to protect wildlife.
4. Targetted enforcement interventions such as patrols, roadblocks and checkpoints can stop the supply of wildlife and so break the links in this chain.
5. Enforcement staff such as police, military, border guards, park rangers and community rangers work together to help protect wildlife in Cambodia, Thailand, Myanmar and Lao PDR.
6. Understand that interagency collaboration and communication among Mongolian agencies is needed to make conservation effective.

Presentation 3: Community Based Wildlife Conservation in Eastern Mongolia

Duration: 1 hr

Presenter: Ann M. Winters and B. Munkhbaatar

Content: WCS Mongolia's Herder Community Based Nature Conservation project is a sub-project under the WCS/USAID Eastern Steppe Living Landscapes project which aims to sustain wildlife and traditional livelihoods in the arid grasslands of Mongolia. Herder community groups are key stakeholders for implementing the Eastern Steppe Living Landscapes Project because they reside in areas of conservation concern, have a direct impact on wildlife populations and can monitor and manage wildlife and natural resources. Herders live in the countryside, are (semi) nomadic and have a traditional lifestyle. Because herders depend on natural resources, they are therefore motivated to conserve them. The goal of the Herder Community Based Nature Conservation project is to sustainably manage natural resources and conserve wildlife in community managed areas through capacity building in herder communities, especially focused on volunteer rangers. WCS Mongolia has been working with 14 herder communities who are interested in nature conservation and sustainable use in their areas. Each of these communities has selected a volunteer ranger to protect and monitor wildlife in their area.

Training aids: Powerpoint presentations.

Summary points:

1. Past activities WCS Mongolia has engaged in with herder communities include:
 - An initial workshop with Herder Community Leaders in July 2006 to introduce the legislation that allows formation of community partnerships under the EPL.
 - The first Volunteer Ranger Training in May 2007 to familiarize volunteer rangers with their rights and responsibilities as outlined under the Environmental Protection Law.
 - Visits to '3 Test Herder Communities' in August 2007 to map herder community areas, discussion action plans and teach basic wildlife monitoring methods.
 - An Impacts Monitoring Workshop held in September 2007 to develop impacts/violations reporting forms for volunteer rangers.
 - A Wildlife Protection Coordination Meeting held in February 2008 with volunteer rangers, soum inspectors and protected areas rangers.
 - Visits to 14 herder community areas in July and August of 2008 to conduct participatory wildlife assessment with community members, map community areas and discuss action planning.
2. Enforcement challenges include illegal hunting by domestic and foreign poachers, lack of communication and support from soum inspectors and protected areas rangers, and other issues beyond the control of herder communities such as climate change and private mineral and oil extraction industries. Despite the challenges, herders are very motivated to conserve wildlife and natural resources in their community managed areas.
3. With the proper skills, herder communities will be able to take action in their areas to sustainably manage and protect wildlife and natural resources. Volunteer rangers have been using the Wildlife and Natural Resource Impacts Reporting Forms to record information about impacts and wildlife use violations in their community managed areas. Through monitoring and evaluation, these activities will be further refined and improved upon.
4. Future activities for this project include:
 - A final Volunteer Ranger Training in mid-September 2008
 - Implementing consistent monitoring and reporting of impacts to wildlife in community areas.

- Refining wildlife protection coordination and taking action.
- Implementing a data base system for summarizing impacts reporting data.
- Developing a community-level strategy for monitoring threats to wildlife, plants and habitats.
- Implementing consistent wildlife monitoring in community managed areas.

5. One of the herder communities is the Yuson Erdene group. The current goals of this group include developing community members' livelihoods, protecting natural resources, distributing information about natural resources to all members, continuing to encourage marmot population growth, meeting with group members twice per season, increasing hay production, and decreasing pasture degradation through better management.

6. The Yuson Erdene volunteer ranger, Monkhaataar, has been conducting patrols to protect marmots. In addition to patrolling for poachers and enforcing the ban on marmot hunting, he monitors marmots during the first week in June, mid-July, and mid-September. He also conducts horseback surveys for wildlife each month in an area frequented by gazelle.

Part II. Legislation and Law Enforcement

Presentation 4: Review of environmental laws pertaining to protected areas (follows module 4a in manual)

Duration: 3 hrs

Presenter: Badam Khaidav

Content: Border guards and environmental inspectors need to know the environmental laws and legislation covering wildlife, plants and their habitats. This section reviewed aspects of the national legislation relevant to hunting, wildlife trade and protected areas. References to some of the provisions were provided to assist with a closer analysis of the laws. It is important for border guards and environmental inspectors to communicate with each other to ensure sharing of information and monitoring of wildlife crime.

Competency achieved:

1. Understand the key articles in the Laws on Hunting and Protected Areas.
2. Know the fees and penalty structure for hunting and fishing violations.
3. Understand the concept of CITES, CBD, Ramsar and CMS, international treaties to which Mongolia is a signatory.

Training aids: Oral presentations, and powerpoint, Badam, K. (Ed.) (2006) Compilation of laws and legislation relating to animals and plants, Ulaanbaatar, State Specialized Inspection Agency of Mongolian Government, Department of Environment, Geodesy and Mapping.

Summary points:

Mr. Badam's presentation was divided in two parts;

- A. General information about Mongolian laws and regulations including information/ministers orders, programs, conventions concerning to Mongolian Law

on Hunting, Fauna, CITES, Plants and Protected Areas, and regulations on weapons and the current situation for environmental crime.

B. Detailed information on practical aspects of law enforcement:

1. Specific procedures for how to administer and enforce environmental laws were given by Mr Badam. Numerous real life examples were given. Fines and penalties for different species were discussed. This was very useful practical knowledge for participants.
2. Border Guards and environmental inspectors share responsibilities in helping Mongolia meet their commitments to the CITES convention. This lecture explained the CITES convention, the groups of CITES restricted species, and how the treaty is administered by the Mongolian Government.

Recommendations:

1. Mr Badam's powerpoint presentations should be compiled into a booklet on how to do wildlife enforcement, and distributed to all border guard posts and outposts.

Suggested follow-up:

1. Include legal training in annual training schedules for border guards, rangers and state inspectors. Use this as an opportunity to update participants on changes to national environmental laws.
2. WCS to update the training manual with content from Mr Badam's lectures.

Part III. Field craft

Presentation 5: Review of use of compass and map for navigation and orientation (follows module 10 in training manual)

Duration: ½ day of classroom instruction plus individual practice outside the classroom, and field practice during the practice patrol exercise.

Presenter: Antony Lynam and Ochirkhuyag Lkhamjav.

Content: Rangers usually use well-defined trails or local knowledge to conduct route marches and enforcement exercises. However, the most effective patrolling is done over wider areas within a reserve, and often involves venturing 'off the beaten track' into unknown or little known areas. In this section participants became familiar with standard topographic maps, and learn to identify parts of maps, read contours and interpret landforms/drainages, understand map scale, mark locations and distances, determine directions and best routes of travel, and use compass and maps for navigation.

Competency achieved:

1. Recognize a topographic map, its level of reliability, and the various pieces of information contained.
2. Correctly interpret landforms and terrain from inspection of contours.
3. Accurately measure area, distances and directions on maps.
4. Accurately report locations of objects on maps in latitude/longitude format. Be able to plot a latitude/longitude location onto a map.

5. Orient a map and correctly determine directions and routes of travel in the field.

Format and training aids: Topographic maps (1:100,000 and custom-designed sheets covering training site), Silva compass, plastic rulers.

Summary points:

1. This module reviewed key map concepts; parts of maps, how to measure distances, bearings and locations. Standard 1:100,000 series topographic maps and custom-designed maps taken from a laptop-based GIS database were used for instruction in the classroom and distributed for field exercises.
2. Four border guard participants had not received this training. Others had participated in one or more training workshops.
3. Each participant was issued a Silva compass for use in the training and these were left with the participants at the conclusion of the training. Correct technique for use of compass for indicating direction, orienting a map, and measuring bearings was taught. Participants learnt how to factor magnetic deviation into bearings. Deviation between grid north and magnetic north is approximately 9 degrees West. Rangers practiced taking bearings on hilltops and walking bearings to find objectives hidden in the grass around the training site.
4. Knowing one's location in the field is critical when documenting poaching and other illegal activity. Participants reviewed latitude and longitude for reporting locations, and estimated latitude and longitude of points from topographic maps.

Recommendations:

1. Border guards at the three zustavs should be encouraged to take topo maps on each patrol and use them to plot their routes.

Suggested follow-up:

1. Refresher training in map and compass should be repeated by WCS Mongolia trainer Ochirkhuyag Lkhamjav in summer of 2009.

Presentation 6. Review of Global Positioning System (GPS) for georeferencing locations and for navigation and orientation (based on module 11 in training manual)

Duration: ½ day of classroom and practical instruction plus individual practice outside the classroom, and field practice during the practice patrol exercise.

Presenter: Antony Lynam and Ochirkhuyag Lkhamjav.

Content: Accurate reporting of live and dead wildlife observations and illegal activity requires the use of Global Positioning System (GPS) devices. None of the participants had previously used GPS so this was new information. This module taught principles of the GPS system, basic functions and operations for the GARMIN Foretrex 101, marking waypoints, tracks, reporting location in the field using latitude and longitude, and measuring distances and bearings.

Competency achieved:

1. Turn a GPS on and off and know how to replace batteries and conduct basic care and maintenance.

2. Know how to obtain a position fix in the field, and the limitations imposed by different types of terrain.
3. Record positions as waypoints and be able to plot the points on a topographic map.
4. Use GOTO function to navigate between waypoints, estimate bearing and distance.
5. Use ROUTES function to store a set of waypoints from a patrol.

Format and training aids: Oral presentation; Garmin Foretrex 101, AAA batteries, compass, topographic maps, steel ruler (10cm).

Summary points:

1. Six Garmin Foretrex 101 GPS units were available for the class plus two Garmin Gecko units, with six groups of two to three participants. The GPS units can be worn like a wristwatch, so are suitable for field staff who patrol on horseback or motorcycle.
2. After a classroom session about principles of GPS, we took participants outside the classroom to work with GPS. Most participants had seen the GPS unit, some were highly proficient, and a few were beginners. However, the more experienced staff helped the less experienced staff to catch up. In the first afternoon, we covered the first of the four competencies described above. Most participants were quickly able to learn how to turn the machine on, receive a location, and record a waypoint.
3. The discussion of latitude and longitude from module 10 was a primer for the presentation of first steps in GPS. The participants were able to see how the GPS recorded location in latitude and longitude, and they knew where the numbers came from. On the second day, a practical exercise had participants creating a waypoint and entering a location, then navigating to the location using the GOTO function to find hidden prizes.
4. Participants learnt how the GPS creates a track log and discovered how to measure distance travelled along a patrol route using this function.
5. Participants noted how using GPS they were able to precisely record a location in the field, and that the ability to pinpoint their location would greatly help them in recording observations.
6. Participants learnt how to use the ROUTE function to store a set of waypoints from a patrol.

Recommendations:

1. The project previously donated eight GPS units; five units to border posts in Nomrog SPA and the SBDA Sumber Border Division, two to the Nomrog SPA rangers and one to the State Inspection Service. We distributed an additional three GPS units at this training, making a total of eleven units distributed.
2. GPS units have been registered at the SBDA Sumber Border Division for use by border guards in Nomrog. Border guards should have access to them when on patrol.
3. Recording accurate location data will be necessary for documenting illegal activity via patrol forms so all staff working in Nomrog SPA will need to gain competency with GPS.
4. Captain O.Adiya (Sumber Border Division, Dornod) showed special aptitude for GPS material and should be asked to join the next training workshop as an assistant instructor.

Suggested follow-up:

1. Refresher training should be done in the summer of 2009 by WCS Mongolia trainer Ochirkhuyag Lkhamjav.

Presentation 7: Patrol strategy and techniques – use of patrol forms

Duration: 1 day

Presenter: Antony Lynam and Ochirkhuyag Lkhamjav

Content: Discuss the importance of patrol forms for accurate recording of wildlife offences, and monitoring of wildlife trends. Review patrol forms completed by border guards, park rangers and inspectors. Summarize the situation for wildlife based on reports from patrols. Review parts of patrol forms and data to be filled in. Discuss correct use of patrol forms. Break into groups and go on practice patrols, using patrol forms to record observations of suspected illegal wildlife and plant activity around the training site. Return to camp, complete patrol reports.

Competency achieved:

1. Understand the reason for recording observations while on patrol and which kind of things to record. The priority should be recording signs of illegal or suspected illegal activity, and as a lower priority recording observations of key species.
2. Understand the correct use of standard patrol forms including authorization, patrol observations, patrol movements and debrief forms.

Training aids: None, oral presentation.

Summary points:

1. A simplified version of the original patrol form devised in 2007 was developed for use by border guards earlier this year. However, we want to try to get the border guards to be as specific as possible with their reporting of wildlife crime. Therefore, we reverted to using the original forms for the instruction and for the patrol exercise. This more complete patrol format should be used in future. It is based on the MIST patrol report standard.

Recommendations:

1. Copies of the original patrol forms (including authorization, observation, movements and debrief) should be printed and sent to Captain Adiya for distribution to border guards in the zastavs.

Suggested follow-up:

1. Captain O. Adiya and Nomrog SPA rangers should be invited to UB to discuss progress with conducting wildlife-focussed patrols at the end of 2008. Information from patrol report forms should be used to assess patrol efforts and whether patrols are being effective at finding evidence of wildlife crime.

Presentations 8-10: Patrol strategy and techniques – current approaches by border guards, protected area rangers and community rangers.

Duration: 2 hrs

Presenter: Captain O.Adiya, R. Unenbat, B. Munkhbaatar

Content: Short presentations from enforcement staff about the particular activities relating to wildlife protection.

Competency achieved:

1. Understand the activities of border guards, protected area rangers and community rangers in helping to detect and monitor illegal wildlife crime in the Eastern Steppes.

Training aids: Oral presentations, illustrated with slides.

Summary points:

1. Border guards have been gathering information about illegal wildlife trade. Through their network of informants they have learnt about several kinds of wildlife crimes occurring in and around the Nomrog SPA. Firstly, gazelles are hunted for consumption by foreign oil rigs west of the reserve. Gazelles may also be hunted for cross-border trade with China. Finally, derevger jirgeruu is widely collected in Khalkh gol soum and is organized by at least three companies, all for commercial trade with China.
2. Protected Areas Authority staff of the Nomrog SPA have recently been given powers of environmental inspectors. This means they are for the first time in a position to be able to make inspections in the reserve and buffer zone, issue warnings and collect penalties for offences. Nomrog SPA staff have held meetings with soum officials to discuss issues concerning derevger jirgeruu collection.
3. Community rangers are working to collect information on wildlife crime in and around important wildlife areas in Dornod Aimag. Because of long distance and poor communications community rangers in the areas closer to soum centres will be more effective at stopping wildlife crime.

Recommendations:

1. Border guards through their existing information networks and strategic location of zastavs and observation posts are in an excellent position to gather information about wildlife crime.
2. Nomrog SPA staff should mobilize themselves to conduct regular mobile patrols using available vehicles. These patrols should be coordinated with the soum inspector, since there is growing evidence of conflicts of interest in the issuing of informal permissions for harvest of various natural resources.
3. Community rangers have a vested interest in the sustainable use of natural resources in their areas. They can assist soum inspectors by being the eyes and ears of the steppe, serving as the source of information about wildlife crime.

Suggested follow-up:

See next section.

Presentation 11. International best practices for wildlife patrols.

Duration: 1 hr plus a 2 day field exercise.

Presenters: Antony Lynam.

Content: General principles for organizing and implementing wildlife patrols in any terrain; examples from Asia. Who are wildlife protection staff and what is their legal basis for doing enforcement? Public awareness of laws, treating people with respect while on patrol, risk assessment and decision-making, facing dangerous situations, kinds of offences, crime scene analysis and gathering evidence.

Competency achieved:

1. Understand the scope of responsibilities of Mongolian enforcement staff
2. Know general principles for applying law enforcement in Mongolian protected areas, and encouraging compliance with laws and regulations

Format and training aids: Powerpoint presentations

Summary points:

1. Practical exercises involved setting up crime scenes, dividing participants into teams, and instructing them to navigate to a given location using GPS, investigate and record detailed observations using patrol forms. The trainees all enjoyed the exercises and learnt quickly from them.
2. A practice 2-day patrol exercise was organized at the end of the training workshop. The purpose of this exercise was to put participants into practical situations where they were forced to use all skills learnt or reviewed during the workshop (navigation, patrol forms, patrol techniques). Two patrol teams were sent out on a horseback patrol in the borderline area. Two other teams conducted vehicle patrols in the buffer zone. Patrols searched for evidence of illegal activity and wildlife. Patrol reports were used to record observations and document the patrol. GPS was used to record waypoints and patrol routes. At the end of the exercise, participants completed patrol reports and submitted them as evidence of their patrol.

Recommendations:

1. Border guards are the only permanent residents in the Nomrog SPA. Therefore, if they can modify their existing strategy for securing the border to target places where wildlife is hunted or smuggled, they can have a potentially large impact on wildlife crime.
2. Currently, rangers spend more time involved in administrative and political activities, and less time on the job of wildlife protection. Now rangers have authority to make inspections and enforce laws, a mobile team of environmental inspectors should be formed. Such a team would work together to administer and enforce laws in a coordinated schedule of activities.
3. Better coordination of law enforcement activities between border guards and environmental inspectors is needed.

Suggested follow-up:

1. Participants fully understand why patrol reporting is needed and some participants produced excellent, detailed patrol reports from the patrol exercise. WCS should encourage border guards and environmental inspectors do conduct patrols focussed on wildlife wherever time and resources permit during the next three months. Blank patrolling reports should be printed and sent to the border guards and to Nomrog SPA






without delay (note that there are some faults in the translation of the forms and these should obviously be rectified before duplication).






2. Before the end of 2008, WCS should invite border guards and Nomrog SPA rangers to UB to report on their patrol activities, share information on the status of wildlife crime, especially cross-border trade and illegal consumption of gazelle. On the basis of this meeting, a strategy should be formed to guide future collaboration wildlife enforcement efforts. It is imperative that progress be demonstrated. Without evidence that border guards and rangers have conducted wildlife enforcement interventions, it is difficult to justify further investment in the program.
3. Assuming progress is reported, WCS should consider finding financial support to help form a mobile Wildlife Enforcement Team comprising border guards, soum and state inspectors and rangers. The team would use an existing vehicle for transport and be provided with gasoline and resources for conducting remote field work such as sleeping equipment, tents, cooking equipment, and 2-way radios in addition to the equipment already supplied through this training (spotting scopes, binoculars, GPS, maps, compass and patrol forms).






Literature cited






- BADAM, K. (Ed.) (2006) *Compilation of laws and legislation relating to animals and plants*, Ulaanbaatar, State Specialized Inspection Agency of Mongolian Government, Department of Environment, Geodesy and Mapping.
- HEFFERNAN, D., E. (2005) A report on an assessment of the protected areas of the eastern steppe of Mongolia. Ulaanbaatar, US Peace Corps and Ministry of Nature and Environment.
- HEFFERNAN, D., E., ZAHLER, P., MERKEL, J., HEFFERNAN, C. A. & JARGALSAIKHAN, C. (2005) An assessment of the protected areas of the Eastern Steppe of Mongolia. *Mongolian Journal of Biological Sciences*, 3, 25-29.
- LYNAM, A. J. (2004) Band of Brothers. *Wildlife Conservation*, 107, 22-27.
- LYNAM, A. J. (2005a) Developing a Wildlife Protection Program for the Nomrog Strictly Protected Area, Mongolia. Stage 1. Law Enforcement Needs Assessment 17th August – 6th September 2005. Bangkok, Wildlife Conservation Society.
- LYNAM, A. J. (2005b) Rainforest Guardians. *Wildlife Conservation*, 108, 8-9.
- LYNAM, A. J. (Ed.) (2006) *Training Handbook for Mongolia Wildlife Protection Staff (Mongolian language)*, Ulaanbaatar, Wildlife Conservation Society.
- OLSON, K., SCHALLER, G. B., MYAGMASUREN, L., ODONKHUU, D. & ZAHLER, P. (2004) Status of ungulates in Nomrog Strictly Protected Area. *Mongolian Journal of Biological Sciences*, 2, 51-53.
- WINGUARD, J. R. & ZAHLER, P. (2006) Silent Steppe: The Illegal Wildlife Trade Crisis in Mongolia. Mongolia Discussion Papers, East Asia and Pacific Environment and Social Development Department. Washington D.C., World Bank.
- ZAHLER, P., LAGHVASUREN, B., READING, R. P., WINGUARD, J. R., AMGALANBAATAR, S., GOMBOBAATAR, S., BARTON, N. W. H. & OWEN, Y. (2004) Illegal and unsustainable wildlife hunting and trade in Mongolia. *Mongolian Journal of Biological Sciences*, 2, 23-32.



Annex 1. Training participants, instructors and training assistants

№	Name	Position	Location
	N. Gangerel	Specialist of Nomrog SPA's Administration	Choibalsan town,. Dornod aimag.
	Ts. Sukhbaatar	Ranger of Nomrog SPA's Administration	Khalkh gol soum. Dornod aimag.
	I. Amanjol	Volunteer Ranger of Nomrog SPA's Administration	Khalkh gol soum. Dornod aimag
	B Munkhbaatar	Volunteer ranger of 'Yusun erdene' herders community	Bayan-Ovoo soum, Khentii aimag
	B. Sanchinbolor	Leiutenant , Border spy	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag.

	B. Ganbayar	Leiutenant. Vice commander of Numrug zastav.	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag. 04 zastav.Numrug
	D. Barjargal	Sergeant of Numrug zastav.	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag. 04 zastav.Numrug
	T. Battur	Sergeant of Numrug zastav	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag. 04 zastav.Numrug
	B. Zorigtkhuu	Master sergeant. Vice commamder of Khar Khonit zastav	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag. 03 zastav.Khar Khonit
	P. Delgerbat	Second sergeant of Khar Khonit zastav	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag. 03 zastav.Khar Khonit

	D. Altanzagas	Master sergeant of Khar Khonit zastav	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag. 03 zastav.Khar Khonit
	D. Khurelchuluun	Leiutenant. Vice commander of Degee gol zastav	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag. 05 zastav.Degee gol
	D. Munkhbat	Master sergeant of Degee gol zastav	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag. 05 zastav.Degee gol
	U. Altanzaya	Sergeant of Degee gol zastav	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag. 05 zastav.Degee gol
Trainers			
	R. Unenbat	Director of Nomrog SPA's Administration	Choibalsan town. Dornod aimag.

	Kh. Badam	Senior inspector of SSIA	Ulaanbaatar city.
	O. Adiya	Captain, Head of Intelegency division of 0198 otryad	Sumber Border Division of SBDA. Khalkh gol soum, Dornod aimag.
	Dr Antony Lynam	Regional Advisor, WCS Asia Programs	Bangkok Thailand,
	Amanda E. Fine	Director of WCS Mongolia Program	Ulaanbaatar city
	Ann M. Winters	Wildlife conservation tecnical advisor of WCS Mongolia Program	Ulaanbaatar

	N. Odonchimeg	Wildlife trade specialist of WCS Mongolia Program	Ulaanbaatar
	L. Ochirkhuyag	Remote sensing /GIS Analyst WCS Mongolia Program	Ulaanbaatar

Annex 2. Participant evaluation.

1. Do you have an understanding of the following terms?

Navigation	yes	(100%)	no
Track and Sign	yes	(100%)	no
Wildlife Conservation	yes	(100%)	no
Law Enforcement	yes	(100%)	no
2. Has your understanding of the conservation status and threats to Nomrog wildlife increased? Please write down the degree of your increased knowledge. (1 is no increase, to 5, greatly increased.)
 1. no new knowledge
 2. know a little more than before workshop
 3. learned a fair amount of new information - **(19%)**
 4. learned a lot - **(25%)**
 5. learned a great deal and believe I can apply this knowledge - **(56%)**
3. Has your understanding of navigation concepts increased? Please circle the degree of your increased knowledge. (1 is no increase, to 5, greatly increased.)
 1. no new knowledge
 2. know a little more than before workshop
 3. learned a fair amount of new information – **(19%)**
 4. learned a lot - **(19%)**
 5. learned a great deal and believe I can apply navigation techniques - **(62%)**
4. Has your appreciation of the importance of law enforcement monitoring increased? Please circle the degree of your increased knowledge. (1 is no increase, to 5, greatly increased.)
 1. no new knowledge
 2. know a little more than before workshop – **(6%)**
 3. learned a fair amount of new information - **(50%)**
 4. learned a lot - **(13%)**
 5. learned a great deal and believe I can apply law enforcement monitoring **(31%)**
5. Navigation techniques are most useful for the following aspects of my work:
 - avoiding getting lost on patrol
 - finding my location in any weather conditions
6. The manual for the workshop is a useful tool. Please circle the number, which you believe most accurate.

1	2	3	4	5
(not useful)	(somewhat useful)	(useful 31%)	(very useful 12%)	(extremely useful 56%)
7. Please list on your paper all, which might apply to the presenters.

The presenters:

 - Were knowledgeable (37%)
 - Were easily understood (75%)
 - Answered questions (37%)
 - Listened well (44%)

- Provided useful examples (69%)
- Translations were effective (81%)
- Allowed for participant interaction (75%)
- Adapted content to our needs/situation (62%)
- Presented something useful/valuable (81%)

Please write responses to the following prompts:

8. The most useful part of the workshop was (no. participants responding in brackets):

- increasing cooperation between agencies
- opportunity to use equipment
- use of GPS and compass, more knowledge about legislation
- field practice was important (2)
- use GPS and more knowledge about future cooperation between agencies
- law enforcement, inspection and monitoring
- general understanding of nature conservation
- to find direction using GPS
- using gps and map
- all
- more knowledge about wildlife conservation of Nomrog SPA (2)
- training was very near to real life
- wildlife conservation and use of GPS
- information about negative human impacts to wildlife

9. The least useful part of the workshop was: No participants responded that there was a least useful part of the workshop. Some responded that no parts were least important.

Please add any additional thoughts or comments you would like to make about the workshop (use the back of you paper for additional space).

- establishing cooperation between agencies is very important
- thank you very much I gained a lot of knowledge from this training
- thanks now I know WCS is not only protecting wildlife but also considering the human aspect of conservation. Because we are living in nature, conserving nature which we are living in means will can improve our livelihoods within the sustainable use of natural resources.
- last year's training was reviewed, in the future I would like to learn and share information and practice about wildlife trade because my job concerns this.
- it will be good if could organize this training again (every year). If this is possible, it will increase cooperation between the agencies
- I liked this training very much, please organize this kind of training again
- organize more training like this in the border area
- thank you and success to wcs staff
- repeat this training if possible every year
- more training in the future like this (2)
- now I have a lot of knowledge about wildlife conservation
- I will use all the knowledge gained in this training to monitor wildlife in my border patrol duties

Annex 3. Photographs from the training workshop



Classroom training was done at the State Border Defence Agency's Degee Gol Outpost. Fifteen border guards and environmental inspectors participated.



During field exercises participants learnt how to locate crime scenes using standard search techniques and document crime scenes using patrol forms.....



Participants reviewed use of map and compass in the classroom....



....participants presented the findings from their practice patrols to the rest of the class.



..... then explored using GPS and maps for field navigation.



A two-day field exercise involved participants being assigned real patrol missions. Navigation skills were used to complete the patrol. Participants worked in groups to plan and execute their patrols, documenting illegal activity where encountered, and writing and presenting patrol reports.